

Dorfman, Schubert, and Death and the Maiden

David Schroeder
Dalhousie University

Follow this and additional works at: <http://docs.lib.purdue.edu/clcweb>

 Part of the [Comparative Literature Commons](#), and the [Critical and Cultural Studies Commons](#)

Dedicated to the dissemination of scholarly and professional information, **Purdue University Press** selects, develops, and distributes quality resources in several key subject areas for which its parent university is famous, including business, technology, health, veterinary medicine, and other selected disciplines in the humanities and sciences.

CLCWeb: Comparative Literature and Culture, the peer-reviewed, full-text, and open-access learned journal in the humanities and social sciences, publishes new scholarship following tenets of the discipline of comparative literature and the field of cultural studies designated as "comparative cultural studies." Publications in the journal are indexed in the Annual Bibliography of English Language and Literature (Chadwyck-Healey), the Arts and Humanities Citation Index (Thomson Reuters ISI), the Humanities Index (Wilson), Humanities International Complete (EBSCO), the International Bibliography of the Modern Language Association of America, and Scopus (Elsevier). The journal is affiliated with the Purdue University Press monograph series of Books in Comparative Cultural Studies. Contact: [<clcweb@purdue.edu>](mailto:clcweb@purdue.edu)

Recommended Citation

Schroeder, David. "Dorfman, Schubert, and Death and the Maiden." *CLCWeb: Comparative Literature and Culture* 9.1 (2007): [<http://dx.doi.org/10.7771/1481-4374.1030>](http://dx.doi.org/10.7771/1481-4374.1030)

This text has been double-blind peer reviewed by 2+1 experts in the field.

The above text, published by Purdue University Press ©Purdue University, has been downloaded 5871 times as of 01/16/15.

CLCWeb: Comparative Literature and Culture, the peer-reviewed, full-text, and open-access learned journal in the humanities and social sciences, publishes new scholarship following tenets of the discipline of comparative literature and the field of cultural studies designated as "comparative cultural studies." In addition to the publication of articles, the journal publishes review articles of scholarly books and publishes research material in its *Library Series*. Publications in the journal are indexed in the Annual Bibliography of English Language and Literature (Chadwyck-Healey), the Arts and Humanities Citation Index (Thomson Reuters ISI), the Humanities Index (Wilson), Humanities International Complete (EBSCO), the International Bibliography of the Modern Language Association of America, and Scopus (Elsevier). The journal is affiliated with the Purdue University Press monograph series of Books in Comparative Cultural Studies. Contact: <clcweb@purdue.edu>

Volume 9 Issue 1 (March 2007) Article 18**David Schroeder,****"Dorfman, Schubert, and *Death and the Maiden*"**<<http://docs.lib.purdue.edu/clcweb/vol9/iss1/18>>

Contents of *CLCWeb: Comparative Literature and Culture* 9.1 (2007)**Thematic Issue *Representing Humanity in an Age of Terror*****Edited by Sophia A. McClennen and Henry James Morello**<<http://docs.lib.purdue.edu/clcweb/vol9/iss1/>>

Abstract: In his article, "Dorfman, Schubert, and *Death and the Maiden*," David Schroeder suggests that the selection of the play's title *Death and the Maiden* (1991) by Ariel Dorfman is a careful one. Schroeder proposes that it is not only that the title of the piece comes directly from Franz Schubert's String Quartet in D minor, so named because it uses material from the song of the same name as the theme for the second movement. Schroeder argues that Dorfman's thoughtful choice is as much related to the strong parallels between Schubert's *Maiden* and Dorfman's character Paulina Salas, as to Dr. Miranda's similarities with Schubert's *Death*. Schroeder further explains that the connection with Schubert's work is also better understood in relation to Schubert's belief in the impossibility of returning to life "as it was before" after destructive episodes. Schroeder argues that Schubert was much more a political creature than has been widely recognized and that Dorfman seems to have sensed intuitively Schubert's political nature. In fact, at the end of the play, as Schroeder argues, it is Schubert's music from the quartet that has the final say.

David SCHROEDER

Dorfman, Schubert, and *Death and the Maiden*

Numerous writers have tried to introduce musical elements into their works and some have managed it with great success. Some of these writers have themselves been sophisticated musicians, such as James Joyce-- who would have won a vocal competition in Dublin had he not been edged out by Ireland's soon-to-be superstar tenor, John McCormick -- or Jane Austen, E.M. Forster, and Elfriede Jelinek, all of whom played the piano seriously if not at a professional level. Others have done it through their associations with musicians, for example Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, who was a close friend of the composers Johann Friedrich Reichardt, Carl Friedrich Zelter, and Felix Mendelssohn; writers such as Arthur Schnitzler and Charles Baudelaire simply brought their enthusiasm for music into the mix. Ariel Dorfman appears to be in the latter group, but that did not prevent him in his 1991 play *Death and the Maiden* from not only finding the aesthetic essence of the music of Franz Schubert, but also of intuiting Schubert's political impetus. Schubert lived in what amounted to a police state in Emperor Franz's Vienna of the first few decades of the 19th century, and he reacted against that in both his behavior and his works. In making Schubert's String quartet in D minor (D810), with its second movement a theme and variations on the song "Der Tod und das Mädchen," central to the play, Dorfman was able to invoke extraordinarily powerful images that allow the play to reach its audiences in ways that otherwise would not be possible. This is no mere clever use of a provocative title. No writer other than Jelinek, winner of the 2004 Nobel Prize in Literature, in her *Die Klavierspielerin*, has infused Schubert with such skill and devastating perception into literature. In struggling with a society unable to find its way after a period of brutality, questioning its capability of returning to civility and decency or even recognizing hope, Dorfman could not have found a spirit more resonant to the same probing than Schubert.

In order to grasp fully the implications of Dorfman's adoption of Schubert, some background on Schubert and his music will be useful. During his life, which ended at the tragically young age of thirty-one in 1828, and in the almost two centuries since, audiences have responded to Schubert entirely unlike the ways they have to other composers. The close relationship he had with his friends prompted them to call him "our Schubert," and in many respects audiences since 1828 have continued to see him in that intimate light. In part, this has resulted from Schubert's approach to music, which, unlike his contemporary Beethoven, who generally saw himself peering down at his audience from dizzying heights in works such as the *Eroica* and Ninth symphonies and the late string quartets, remaining aloof from his audience, Schubert does everything possible to shrink that distance, standing next to his listeners instead of above them. Schubert achieves this by writing virtually all of his works (with the exception of his operas) with himself as one of the performers, placing him directly beside the people he wishes most of all to reach -- his fellow performers. As a singer, pianist, violinist, and violist, he had no difficulty writing himself as a performer into his works. Even his symphonies, perhaps the most public type of composition, intended for a listening audience in a concert hall, Schubert wrote for fellow students, and then family and friends, with himself as principal violist. This includes his two final symphonies, the "Unfinished" and the "Great" Symphony in C major, now clearly public works in the mold of Beethoven, which still have that sense of intimacy of the performers' involvement, and one could argue that the "Unfinished" specifically grapples with that issue (Kurth 24-29). In songs, chamber music, piano four-hands, and solo pieces there can be no question that these works belong to the performers, who, in Schubert's time, could share that experience with him. Indirectly that tradition continued after his death, and one could even suggest that audiences at concerts listening to Schubert can feel the works from the performers' perspective, especially if they have ever had the experience of playing any of his music.

Schubert may reach his audience in a way entirely different from that of Beethoven, but what he has

to offer is no less profound. The intimacy of his music means that in some respects it illuminates Schubert himself, probing some of his darkest and most disturbing inner impulses, in some cases too devastating to say in words, lending themselves better to the poetic means of music. Over and over he shows us how this works in his songs, certainly the cornerstone of his compositional career, writing well over six hundred in his brief life, and the songs can often stand as the models for understanding some of his instrumental approaches. One of the procedures he frequently employs in his songs and instrumental works is a three-part format that parallels his own deepest experiences of potential hope and destruction. Two of the songs in the cycle *Winterreise*, "Der Lindenbaum" ("The Linden Tree") and "Frühlingstraum" ("Dream of Spring") illustrate the format well, along with numerous other songs. "Der Lindenbaum," after a piano introduction, gives the most beautifully lyrical melody found in the entire cycle of twenty-four songs, and that lyricism parallels the nostalgia of the text, as the protagonist remembers the associations of the tree with his loved one. As he walks away from the tree a shift to the minor key and a triplet figure in the accompaniment introduce an element of disruption. Suddenly a gust of wind hits him in the face, and the key change here, along with the greater agitation of the music, remind him of the hopelessness of his situation. The concluding section of the song returns to the opening melody, but it can no longer be as it was, now infiltrated by the triplets associated with his despair. This format signals a blunt message, that nostalgia will be followed by destruction, and try as one may, there is no possibility of returning to that earlier state of grace. Aside from songs, this musical procedure plays itself out over and over in instrumental works, especially those written in his last few years when he knew that syphilis would soon bring his life to an end. These works include the slow movements of the Piano Trio in E flat (D929), the String Quintet in C (D956), the Piano Sonata in A (D959), and others. After the devastation of these movements, along with the entire cycle *Winterreise*, one doubts that hope can be possible, yet, the music itself allows for the possibility of hope, as its beauty can transcend the devastation, in the same manner that he learned as a teenager that laments, always in a feminine voice, can cope with grief by transforming it into beauty.

The song "Der Tod und das Mädchen," in its own peculiar way, follows the format just described, providing an early example, since Schubert wrote it in 1817. In order to achieve this format, the music takes on a life of its own, generating something that the original poetic text by Matthias Claudius cannot. Schubert used Claudius's text without any alterations, unlike his settings of some other poems, and Claudius's text clearly has two parts, with the Maiden as speaker in the first strophe, followed by Death in the second: "The Maiden: 'It's all over! Alas, it's all over now. Go, savage man of bone! I am still young -- go, devoted one! And do not molest me.' Death: 'Give me your hand, you fair and tender form! I am a friend; I do not come to punish. Be of good cheer! I am not savage. You shall sleep gently in my arms'" (Trans. Emily Ezust <<http://www.recmusic.org/lieder>>) ("Das Mädchen: 'Vorüber! Ach, vorüber! Geh wilder Knochenmann! Ich bin noch jung, geh Lieber! Und rühre mich nicht an.' Der Tod: 'Gib deine Hand, du schön und zart Gebild! Bin Freund, und komme nicht, zu strafen. Sei gutes Muts! Ich bin nicht wild, Sollst sanft in meinen Armen schlafen!'") (<<http://www.recmusic.org/lieder>>). As a two-part form, things progress clearly from the Maiden's anxiety and devastation in contemplating death to the convincing assurances by Death of friendship and comfort. Schubert's version makes matters considerably less clear, putting the song in the key of D minor, a key associated throughout the previous century with death and storms, and he provides a piano introduction of eight bars that we soon discover is the voice of Death. Even the dactyl rhythm of this introduction has a death association, used for example by Christoph Willibald von Gluck in his opera *Alceste* (well known to Schubert) for the oracle, the voice of the underworld, to announce that Admetus must die unless someone else will die in his place. In Schubert's setting, Death speaks first, in the piano alone, gently and quietly, with an engaging lyrical melody moving as an inner voice. When the Maiden speaks, the pace quickens, and her line

becomes agitated, as does the new rhythm in the accompaniment, indicating that calm and order have broken down. But by the time she reaches her last words, "und rühre mich nicht an," which she repeats, the rhythm of the accompaniment shifts, reverting to the rhythm of Death. This appears to take the agitation out of her voice, but it may have a slightly more ominous touch, as Death now absorbs her voice. When Death speaks, returning to the familiar rhythm of the introduction, what should be comforting fails to be believable since it lacks the lyricism of the introduction; here Death speaks in an unmusical monotone, and the accompaniment lacks the inner voice melody of the introduction. Only in the instrumental conclusion does anything akin to that melody occur, now in D major, but melodically diminished in comparison to the introduction. D major should send a ray of light, but because of the melodic impoverishment, it does not persuade. We have moved from the most engaging part of the song, the introduction, through a breakdown, to a somewhat meaner Death than the opening, to a concluding sleight of hand major key shift that cannot convince. The opening sustains the words spoken by Death that come later, but the music accompanying those words undermines their credibility: even Death may be something other than what it claims to be.

Dorfman does not use this song in his play, only the String Quartet in D minor from 1824, which has been dubbed "The Death and the Maiden" Quartet because of the free adaptation of the theme from the song for the slow movement's theme and variations. Schubert did not give the quartet, which remains one of his best-known works, this name, but the epithet has stuck, leading some to believe that an ominous aura of death permeates the entire quartet. That is clearly not the case; the third movement, a scherzo, borrows directly from one of Schubert's German dances (D790, no. 6), giving it a light atmosphere and the presto finale also has a dance spirit. The first movement certainly does plant ominous thoughts in our minds, and here with the helter-skelter pace we have something of the desperation of the girl from the song, as she shrieks her fear of death. The key of D minor, as with the song, works effectively here, and little changes throughout the movement to alter the disturbing atmosphere evident from the beginning. Moments of lyricism always quickly give way to the underlying tension. If the work had ended with this movement we would have reason to be concerned; the three subsequent movements clearly get beyond it. The second movement, the only one identified by Dorfman in the play, explores ambiguity similar to that of the song. This movement, now in G minor, uses material from the song associated only with Death, derived from the eight-bar introduction of the song. While the first eight bars of this movement of the quartet adhere closely to the opening of the song, the next sixteen bars of the twenty-four-bar theme move beyond it, sometimes invoking the music accompanying Death as a speaker, but also expanding on the opening theme harmonically and melodically. The theme already incorporates the gentle side of Death with an appeal to calm and comfort, but at the same time points to Death's inability to be convincing in that role. The variations which follow continue this ambiguity, starting out as conventional Viennese variations that add figuration to the melodic line, but this mode changes in subsequent variations as the intensity of the interaction of all four voices occasionally probes disturbing musical ideas. In fact, at times the voices appear to be working at cross purposes, generating high levels of conflict. In the end the movement fades away as quietly as the musicians can play, returning to the opening theme, now major, but very much abbreviated, without the attempt, as happens in the song, to convince us of reconciliation.

The type of musical ambiguity found in this and other works reflects key aspects of Schubert's life, not the least of which was his manner of trying to come to terms with the police state in which he lived. As police states go, this one could not compare to the oppression of Pinochet's Chile, since it remained relatively free of torture and murder by the secret police, and to some extent could even be manipulated by clever dissenters. Yet, a standard for liberty and decency remained fresh in the wistful memories of some, going back to the reforms of Joseph II during the decade starting in 1780, before the perceived

threats from Jacobins or the terrors in France forced a retrenchment. Now with Metternich and his "system" in control, and the likes of Sedlnitsky in charge of the police commission, law and order seemed to be the only things that mattered, with Metternich, backed up by a vast network of spies and censors, expecting nothing less than blind obedience to authority. All types of political discussion became taboo, and public gatherings of any kind fell under suspicion, including concert attendance. Subversive student movements sprang up across the empire to combat the oppression, notably the *Burschenschaft-s*, and Schubert had close ties with members of this organization in Vienna. In fact, this resulted in Schubert's arrest in March 1820, at the rooms of his friend Johann Senn, and while Schubert was released quickly, Senn, a dangerous person in the estimation of the police, spent fourteen months in prison, followed by banishment from Vienna (see Deutsch 128-30).

This arrest came on the heels of a not unusual way for Schubert and his friends to spend their evenings, at a favorite tavern drinking heavily. On their return to Senn's rooms, where they found the police rifling through Senn's papers, they did not handle the situation with tact, Senn even railing at the police that they were too stupid to discover his secrets. Schubert developed a reputation for his drinking, including turning up at the residences of Viennese officials as an invited musical guest completely drunk, although some of these descriptions may be apocryphal considering his extraordinary productivity as a composer. Certainly an element of truth can be found in the descriptions, and in fact the behavior may very well have been intentional, as a reaction to the conventional social conformity that Metternich attempted to instill. Also, Schubert belonged to various reading clubs as well as nonsense societies throughout his life, all of which the authorities had banned as subversive. Not only students belonged to these but pillars of the community as well, happily joining despite the prohibition; it appears they could not resist the sport of police baiting, no doubt howling with laughter when the police construed their ribald poems, songs, and facetious rites and rituals as nefariously cryptic documents (Hanson 58). Still, the police had the power to pass judgment, and as with the unfortunate Senn, they often did. Even the Schubertiades, gatherings of Schubert and his friends for the performances of his songs, may have provided a camouflage for undercover political activity (Hilmar 27-30). Not only did Schubert take the authorities on in his behavior and activities but he did in his works as well. The dark vision already referred to not only had personal implications but surely spoke of an entire society, lamenting the absence of freedom. An opera that Schubert wrote late in 1822 in collaboration with his equally subversive friend, Franz von Schober, as I argue in my forthcoming book *Our Schubert*, may very well have been a veiled attack on Metternich's system, designed not for musical greatness and posterity, but in a style that could be immediately accessible.

The title used by Dorfman, *Death and the Maiden*, would be entirely apt and provocative, even if the play held no other reference to Schubert. The play reflects vividly and painfully on the dark time of imprisonment and torture of the central character Paulina Salas, and her treatment by the person she believes is responsible for torturing her, the "doctor death" Roberto Miranda. By pure chance Paulina's husband, Gerardo Escobar, brings Dr. Miranda to their home one dark night after the horror in their country, post-Pinochet Chile, has ended (Gerardo has been chosen to head the commission that will investigate the crimes during the years of dictatorship), and recognizing the voice of her torturer, she feels a shock wave prodding her into action. As a survivor, Paulina can have no voice in the proceedings of her husband's commission, so with full certainty that she now has her oppressor within her grasp, she takes matters into her own hands. In fact Schubert does play a role in the play, and this raises some extremely provocative issues, ones that critics lacking familiarity with his music have not noticed. Highly charged by Chilean politics, the play immediately created controversy after its first performance in London in July 1991, prompting some to wonder if such an incendiary scenario could do anything but set back the cause of reconciliation in Chile. Dorfman and his supporters saw it in a very different way, that

unimaginable horrors had occurred, and these could not now be swept under the carpet as though they had not really been all that bad (Morace 135-36). Paulina lashes out at Roberto with a ferociousness that surprises her husband, binding her former captor and running him through her own unofficial court, giving her husband the role of lawyer for the defense. Gerardo must face the past as his country must, and his ambivalence quickly shows: having already established a friendly rapport with Roberto, he objects to the treatment Paulina insists on, especially since he believes she cannot be absolutely certain about Roberto's identity, depending purely on sound and smell since she had been blindfolded in captivity. Gerardo also has managed to suppress his memory of the reason she had been brutalized so severely, that as his assistant while he edited an underground opposition newspaper, her refusal to reveal his identity meant he remained unscathed while she paid the heaviest possible price, of repeated rape and brutal beatings.

Here we have a play not in any way lacking in substance; with or without Schubert it will twist the members of the audience inside out, and the mirror put in front of the audience at the end in effect puts the audience members on the stage. The first reference to Schubert comes in Act 1, scene 4, and it is substantial, as Paulina now talks to Roberto after having awakened him at gunpoint and tying him up. She steps out to look in his car, and on her return she says to Roberto:

I took this [a cassette] out of your car -- I took the liberty -- what if we listen to some Schubert while I make breakfast, a nice breakfast, Doctor? *Death and the Maiden*? [She puts it into the cassette player. We begin to hear Schubert's quartet *Death and the Maiden*.] D'you know how long it's been since I last listened to this quartet? If it's on the radio, I turn it off, I even try not to go out much, though Gerardo has all these social events...but I always pray they won't put on Schubert. One night we were dining with -- they were extremely important people, and our hostess happened to put Schubert on, a piano sonata, and I thought, do I switch it off or do I leave, but my body decided for me, I felt extremely ill right then and there and Gerardo had to take me home, so we left them there listening to Schubert and nobody knew what had made me ill, so I pray they won't play that anywhere I go, any Schubert at all, strange isn't it, when he used to be, and I would say, yes I really would say, he's still my favorite composer, such a sad, noble sense of life. But I always promised myself a time would come to recover him, bring him back from the grave so to speak, and just sitting here listening to him with you I know that I was right, that I'm -- so many things that are going to change from now on, right? To think I was on the verge of throwing my whole Schubert collection out, crazy! (raising her voice, to Gerardo) Isn't this quartet marvelous, my love? (to Roberto) And now I'll be able to listen to my Schubert again, even go to a concert like we used to. Did you know that Schubert was homosexual? But of course you do, you're the one who kept repeating it over and over again while you played *Death and the Maiden*. Is this the very cassette, Doctor, or do you buy a new one every year to keep the sound pure? (Dorfman 21-22)

Roberto played this quartet for his victims, using it to gain their trust, and as a way of alleviating their suffering, he later claims. He too loves Schubert, a curious thing for victim and oppressor to share.

Curious perhaps, but not unprecedented, and for this Dorfman had to look back no further than the Nazi era and the appropriation of the music of Wagner. Hitler became the ultimate Wagnerite, perhaps even taking Wagner's works as a model for his political ambitions and conceptions (Köhler 20), but also using Wagner as a battering ram against the sensibilities of Jews. Despite Wagner's own anti-Semitism and vestiges of that in the operas (on this, see, e.g., Millington 45-48, 255), anti-Semites had no exclusive claim to the music of Wagner, as many assimilated Jews regarded this music as every bit their own as simply one more pillar in the edifice of great German culture they believed they possessed. Because of the way the music was used by the Nazis it became repulsive to many Jews in the post-war years, especially in Israel where for many years an unofficial ban existed on the performance of Wagner. When Zubin Mehta broke that ban in 1981, performing excerpts from *Tristan und Isolde* with the Israel Philharmonic Orchestra, the resulting controversy revealed strong division on the subject (Uscher 8), with most members of the orchestra supporting the performance. Many Israelis did not support the ban in the first place and others may simply have wished to hear the music of Wagner again. In fact, as early as 1941 the tugging on Wagner by both sides was made very apparent by Charles Chaplin in *The Great*

Dictator, with the two sides represented by Chaplin playing the Jewish barber and the Aryan dictator both making equal claim to Wagner through use of the Prelude to *Lohengrin* (Schroeder 205-06). For Paulina, Schubert stands as a complex image, not confined to a single role. Not just a favorite composer, Schubert represents for her everything she values about a civilized society, a nobility of spirit that vanished during the years of oppression and needed, like civilized society itself, to be recovered -- to "bring him back from the grave." Dorfman believes the world is sufficiently populated with Schubert lovers that this image will be understood, that Schubert can take on the status of representing what we all value most highly. In case we do not get it, he puts the strongest possible words into Paulina's mouth, that her road to return depends on ridding the world of vermin like Roberto, "so I can listen to my Schubert without thinking that you'll also be listening to it, soiling my day and my Schubert and my country and my husband. That's what I need" (63). We know how much country and husband mean to her because she puts these beside Schubert, "my Schubert," now the ultimate image not only of passion but of possession. With this grouping she does not have to go on at length about her love of country and husband because the association with Schubert amply takes care of that. Even beyond that, Schubert becomes the symbol of the struggle for justice, now as politically charged as personally meaningful.

But Schubert hovers above the play as much more than a symbol or image, in fact giving Paulina the strength to get through her hideous ordeal. In his role as Dr. Death, Roberto may have thought in a perverse way that playing *Death and the Maiden* actually did alleviate suffering for the victims, although since it did not go against his grain to rape Paulina, one cannot take his statement on this too seriously. A fellow torturer persuaded him that the female victims like being raped: "all these bitches like it and if you put on that sweet little music of yours, they'll get even cozier" (60). With the good-cop-bad-cop routine in which Roberto played the good cop, Paulina was initially taken in by his more gentle approach, and beyond that he played the Schubert quartet. On hearing it, she now recalled, "there is no way of describing what it means to hear that wonderful music in the darkness, when you haven't eaten for the last three days, when your body is falling apart, when" (58). Gerardo freely admits that he would have broken down at the first hint of torture, but Paulina incredibly got through it, and nothing helped her to do that more than Schubert. She says she heard a Schubert quartet, not saying which one or which movement, but we can probably assume the second movement of *Death and the Maiden*, the theme and variations on Schubert's song of the same name. She now responds to Death's role not as an ogre, but as a consoling friend, and in her brush with death it appeared she could isolate this aspect of the Schubert, finding the highest life-affirming value in this rendition of death.

Schubert also plays a darker role in this play, and Dorfman sets this up through a brilliant use of very simple technology -- two cassette recorders. Paulina uses one of them to play Roberto's recording of the Schubert quartet, while she gives another machine to Roberto to record his confession for her kangaroo court, which he does while the Schubert continues to play. As he records his confession, everything comes together: "In the darkness, we hear Roberto's voice overlapping with Paulina's and the second movement of *Death and the Maiden*" (58). At that very moment she has been explaining what the Schubert meant to her, and in his confession he explains how he thought the Schubert would alleviate suffering of the prisoners. After this explanation a new stage direction follows: "The lights go up as if the moon were coming out. It is nighttime. Roberto is in front of the cassette recorder, confessing. The Schubert fades" (58). She continues, describing the horrors of torture, no longer with actual Schubert music in the background, but it is as though she has invoked one of the destructive movements in Schubert, the slow movements of the Quartet in G or the Quintet in C, Schubert now offering no consolation as he does in *Death and the Maiden* but raw devastation and annihilation. At Schubert's darkest moments one must question if there can be any type of recovery, and Paulina surely struggles with the same demons. She thinks it may be possible if she destroys her oppressor, but even that offers

no guarantee. If she were to kill him out of revenge, where would she stand in the civilized society she still believes in? Gerardo struggles with the same dilemma, this custodian of fairness and justice, wavering between the need to avenge Paulina (and the people) or to go about the business of seeking justice in an authorized way. As he moves closer toward her position and she vents her darkest thoughts of destruction, they reach a state that Schubert knew well and occasionally reveals in his music. The cassette players carry both the voice of Roberto and the Schubert quartet, a fused electronic reproduction that makes them as one, one as odious as the other. This fusion can be problematic for Paulina in other ways as well. She believes she has now recovered her beloved Schubert, and all the humanizing things that means, but Schubert never lets us escape the other side, reminding us constantly that we can never return to the beautiful view of the world we seem convinced existed at one time before things fell apart. The new world that Paulina must bravely enter is forever tainted; Schubert will not only help her through it but he will remind her that it is nothing like the beautiful world she thought she once knew. She, the devastated Maiden, will be led by an ambiguously comforting and ominous voice of Death.

Schubert has been our guide in this play through every possible emotion, wholesome and hideous, and Dorfman does not allow us to slink away without contemplating how we would respond if we were in Paulina's or Gerardo's shoes. The play ends in ambiguity, no repentance from Roberto and no death blow from Paulina, with the audience becoming the fourth actor as a giant mirror descends so they no longer see the actors but only themselves, "forcing the members of the audience to look at themselves" (66), as Dorfman puts it. The play ends as an imaginary concert, with Paulina and Gerardo sitting in the audience facing the giant mirror, with banal conversation before the music that mixes not being able to name the murderers and Paulina's ability to mix "a margarita that'll stand your hair on end" (68). The music starts, *Death and the Maiden* of course, and now audience members Paulina and Gerardo look at each other and then toward the stage into the mirror. The mirror may seem a heavy-handed ploy, but in fact it does something that Schubert also does, as I noted above. It completely eliminates the distance between the audience and the play, making the audience part of the play, through self-consciousness being forced to address the issues of the play as virtual players on the stage. Dorfman must have had some sense that this welding of play and audience could be given an infusion by having a performance of Schubert going on at this final moment, in fact giving Schubert the final say: "The lights go down while the music plays and plays and plays. Curtain" (68). Just as Schubert invites his audience as performers into his world, Dorfman does the same, not with words at the end, but with the voice of Schubert, whose presence adds an intriguing dimension to the play. The exit to the theater now becomes the stage door exit.

Works Cited

- Claudius, Matthias. "Der Tod und das Mädchen / Death and the Maiden." Trans. Emily Ezust. *The Lied and Art Song Texts Pages: Texts and Translations to Lieder* (2007): <<http://www.recmusic.org/lieder>>.
- Deutsch, Otto Erich. *Schubert: A Documentary Biography*. Trans. Eric Blom. London: J.M. Dent and Sons, 1946.
- Dorfman, Ariel. *Death and the Maiden*. New York: Penguin Books, 1991.
- Hanson, Alice M. *Musical Life in Biedermeier Vienna*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1985.
- Hilmar, Ernst. *Franz Schubert in His Time*. Trans. Reinhard G. Pauly. Portland: Amadeus P, 1988.
- Köhler, Joachim. *Wagner's Hitler: The Prophet and His Disciple*. Trans. Ronald Taylor. Cambridge: Polity, 2000.
- Kurth, Richard. "On the Subject of Schubert's 'Unfinished' Symphony: *Was bedeutet die Bewegung?*" *19th-Century Music* 23 (1999): 3-32.
- Millington, Barry. *Wagner*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 1984.
- Morace, Robert A. "The Life and Times of *Death and the Maiden*." *Texas Studies in Literature and Language* 42.2 (2000): 135-53.
- Schroeder, David. *Cinema's Illusions, Opera's Allure: The Operatic Impulse in Film*. New York: Continuum, 2002.

Uscher, Nancy. "Wagner, Strauss, and Israel." *The American Music Teacher* 33.6 (1984): 8-11.

Author's profile: David Schroeder teaches in the Department of Music at Dalhousie University. His book publications include *Haydn and the Enlightenment* (1990), *Mozart in Revolt: Strategies of Resistance, Mischief, and Deception* (1999), and *Cinema's Illusions, Opera's Allure: The Operatic Impulse in Film* (2002) and he has just finished his fourth book entitled *Our Schubert*. His other recent publications include contributions to *The Cambridge Companion to Mozart*, *The Cambridge Companion to Haydn*, *The Oxford Composer Companions: Haydn*, and the forthcoming *Cambridge History of Eighteenth-Century Music*. His numerous articles on Schubert, Haydn, Mozart, Berg, Webern, Schoenberg, and Enlightenment issues have appeared in, among other journals, *The Musical Quarterly*, *Music and Letters*, *The Music Review*, *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, *Mosaic*, and *The Musical Times*. Schroeder is currently writing a book on Alfred Hitchcock and music. E-mail: <david.schroeder@dal.ca>